The Limitations of Ruler-and-Compass Constructions

Hayden Jananthan

Vanderbilt University

Ruler and compass constructions involve the following tools:

Ruler and compass constructions involve the following tools:

• Given constructed points A, B, we can draw the line \overleftrightarrow{AB} or the line segment \overline{AB} .

Ruler and compass constructions involve the following tools:

- Given constructed points A, B, we can draw the line \overleftrightarrow{AB} or the line segment \overline{AB} .
- Given constructed points *A*, *B*, we can draw the circle *C* with center *A* which passes through *B*.

Ruler and compass constructions involve the following tools:

- Given constructed points A, B, we can draw the line \overleftrightarrow{AB} or the line segment \overline{AB} .
- Given constructed points *A*, *B*, we can draw the circle *C* with center *A* which passes through *B*.

Ruler and compass constructions involve the following tools:

- Given constructed points A, B, we can draw the line \overleftrightarrow{AB} or the line segment \overline{AB} .
- Given constructed points *A*, *B*, we can draw the circle *C* with center *A* which passes through *B*.

What are "constructed points"? We define them inductively:

• We start by letting (0,0) and (0,1) be constructed.

Ruler and compass constructions involve the following tools:

- Given constructed points A, B, we can draw the line \overleftrightarrow{AB} or the line segment \overline{AB} .
- Given constructed points *A*, *B*, we can draw the circle *C* with center *A* which passes through *B*.

- We start by letting (0,0) and (0,1) be constructed.
- If lines ℓ_1, ℓ_2 have been constructed already, then their intersection point have been constructed.

Ruler and compass constructions involve the following tools:

- Given constructed points A, B, we can draw the line \overleftrightarrow{AB} or the line segment \overline{AB} .
- Given constructed points *A*, *B*, we can draw the circle *C* with center *A* which passes through *B*.

- We start by letting (0,0) and (0,1) be constructed.
- If lines ℓ_1, ℓ_2 have been constructed already, then their intersection point have been constructed.
- If (distinct) circles C_1, C_2 have been constructed already, then their intersection points have been constructed.

Ruler and compass constructions involve the following tools:

- Given constructed points A, B, we can draw the line \overleftrightarrow{AB} or the line segment \overline{AB} .
- Given constructed points *A*, *B*, we can draw the circle *C* with center *A* which passes through *B*.

- We start by letting (0,0) and (0,1) be constructed.
- If lines ℓ_1, ℓ_2 have been constructed already, then their intersection point have been constructed.
- If (distinct) circles C_1, C_2 have been constructed already, then their intersection points have been constructed.
- If the line ℓ and circle C have been constructed already, then their intersection points have been constructed.

A B C

A















Construct Perpendicular Line ℓ_{\perp} to line $\ell = \overleftrightarrow{AB}$ through point C

Case 2: C not incident to ℓ



Draw Parallel Line Through Given Point

A B C

Draw Parallel Line Through Given Point



Draw Parallel Line Through Given Point











Case 2: Collinear

ArB

С
















Translate Line Segment

Case 2: Collinear



Squaring the Circle: constructing a circle with Area π . Equivalently, constructing a line segment of length $\sqrt{\pi}$.

Squaring the Circle: constructing a circle with Area π . Equivalently, constructing a line segment of length $\sqrt{\pi}$.

Doubling the Cube: Constructing a line segment of length $\sqrt[3]{2}$ (a cube with side length $\sqrt[3]{2}$ has volume 2).

Squaring the Circle: constructing a circle with Area π . Equivalently, constructing a line segment of length $\sqrt{\pi}$.

Doubling the Cube: Constructing a line segment of length $\sqrt[3]{2}$ (a cube with side length $\sqrt[3]{2}$ has volume 2).

Angle trisection: Showing that any angle which can be constructed can also be trisected, e.g. a 60° angle can be constructed, so can a 20° angle be constructed as well?

Squaring the Circle: constructing a circle with Area π . Equivalently, constructing a line segment of length $\sqrt{\pi}$.

Doubling the Cube: Constructing a line segment of length $\sqrt[3]{2}$ (a cube with side length $\sqrt[3]{2}$ has volume 2).

Angle trisection: Showing that any angle which can be constructed can also be trisected, e.g. a 60° angle can be constructed, so can a 20° angle be constructed as well?

It wasn't until the 1800s that these constructions were proven to *not* be possible.

A point (a, b) is **constructible** if it can be constructed in a finite number of steps starting with the constructed points (0,0) and (1,0).

A point (a, b) is **constructible** if it can be constructed in a finite number of steps starting with the constructed points (0,0) and (1,0). A real number r is **constructible** if (r,0) is constructible.

A point (a, b) is **constructible** if it can be constructed in a finite number of steps starting with the constructed points (0,0) and (1,0). A real number r is **constructible** if (r,0) is constructible.

Lemma

Let r be a real number. The following are equivalent:

A point (a, b) is **constructible** if it can be constructed in a finite number of steps starting with the constructed points (0,0) and (1,0). A real number r is **constructible** if (r,0) is constructible.

Lemma

Let r be a real number. The following are equivalent:

1 *r* is constructible.

A point (a, b) is **constructible** if it can be constructed in a finite number of steps starting with the constructed points (0,0) and (1,0). A real number r is **constructible** if (r,0) is constructible.

Lemma

Let r be a real number. The following are equivalent:

- **1** r is constructible.
- A line segment of length |r| can be constructed in a finite number of steps starting with the constructed points (0,0) and (1,0).

Proof.

A point (a, b) is **constructible** if it can be constructed in a finite number of steps starting with the constructed points (0,0) and (1,0). A real number r is **constructible** if (r,0) is constructible.

Lemma

Let r be a real number. The following are equivalent:

- I r is constructible.
- A line segment of length |r| can be constructed in a finite number of steps starting with the constructed points (0,0) and (1,0).

Proof.

• \Rightarrow • If *r* is constructible, then the line segment from (0,0) to (|r|,0) has length |r|.

A point (a, b) is **constructible** if it can be constructed in a finite number of steps starting with the constructed points (0,0) and (1,0). A real number r is **constructible** if (r,0) is constructible.

Lemma

Let r be a real number. The following are equivalent:

- I r is constructible.
- A line segment of length |r| can be constructed in a finite number of steps starting with the constructed points (0,0) and (1,0).

Proof.

- \Rightarrow If *r* is constructible, then the line segment from (0,0) to (|r|,0) has length |r|.

Closure under Negation

Consider below diagram:



-r is one of |r| or -|r|.

Closure under Addition



For $r, s \ge 0$, the above construction shows r + s and r - s are constructible. If r is negative, then

$$r+s=-((-r)+(-s))$$

Closure under Multiplication



For $r, s \ge 0$, the above construction shows there is a line segment of length $r \cdot s$.

If either r or s are negative, then

$$r \cdot s = -((-r) \cdot s) = -(r \cdot (-s)) = (-r) \cdot (-s)$$

Closure under Reciprocation



For r > 0, the above construction shows there is a line segment of length 1/r. If r < 0, then

$$\frac{1}{-r} = -\frac{1}{r}$$

Closure under Square Roots



We construct the circle of radius $\frac{1+r}{2}$ centered at $\left(\frac{r-1}{2}, 0\right)$. This circle intersects the *y*-axis at $(0, \pm \sqrt{r})$.

Theorem

Suppose r is a real number. The following are equivalent:

Theorem

Suppose r is a real number. The following are equivalent:

I r is constructible.

Theorem

Suppose r is a real number. The following are equivalent:

- I r is constructible.
- r is the result of starting with 0 and 1 and applying the operations of addition, subtraction, multiplication, division, and taking square roots.

Theorem

Suppose r is a real number. The following are equivalent:

- I r is constructible.
- r is the result of starting with 0 and 1 and applying the operations of addition, subtraction, multiplication, division, and taking square roots.

Proof.

Theorem

Suppose r is a real number. The following are equivalent:

- I r is constructible.
- r is the result of starting with 0 and 1 and applying the operations of addition, subtraction, multiplication, division, and taking square roots.

Proof.

Previously shown that the set of constructible numbers is closed under the given operations. 0,1 are defined to be constructible.

Theorem

Suppose r is a real number. The following are equivalent:

- I r is constructible.
- r is the result of starting with 0 and 1 and applying the operations of addition, subtraction, multiplication, division, and taking square roots.

Proof.

- Previously shown that the set of constructible numbers is closed under the given operations. 0,1 are defined to be constructible.
- $\mathbf{0} \Rightarrow \mathbf{0}$ Must analyze three kinds of intersections:
 - two lines
 - a circle and a line
 - two circle

Intersection of two Lines

Suppose ℓ_1, ℓ_2 are the lines

$$\ell_1 a_1 x + b_1 y = c_1$$
$$\ell_2 a_2 x + b_2 y = c_2$$

Intersection of two Lines

Suppose ℓ_1, ℓ_2 are the lines

$$\ell_1 a_1 x + b_1 y = c_1$$

$$\ell_2 a_2 x + b_2 y = c_2$$

At least one of a_1, b_1 are $\neq 0$, say $a_1 \neq 0$. Then

$$a_1x + b_1y = c_1 \Leftrightarrow x = \frac{c_1}{a_1} - \frac{b_1}{a_1}y$$

Intersection of two Lines

Suppose ℓ_1, ℓ_2 are the lines

$$\ell_1 a_1 x + b_1 y = c_1$$

$$\ell_2 a_2 x + b_2 y = c_2$$

At least one of a_1, b_1 are $\neq 0$, say $a_1 \neq 0$. Then

$$a_1x + b_1y = c_1 \Leftrightarrow x = \frac{c_1}{a_1} - \frac{b_1}{a_1}y$$

c	\sim
5	v

$$a_2\left(\frac{c_1}{a_1}-\frac{b_1}{a_1}y\right)+b_2y=c_2$$

Intersection of two Lines

Suppose ℓ_1, ℓ_2 are the lines

$$\ell_1 a_1 x + b_1 y = c_1$$

$$\ell_2 a_2 x + b_2 y = c_2$$

At least one of a_1, b_1 are $\neq 0$, say $a_1 \neq 0$. Then

$$a_1x + b_1y = c_1 \Leftrightarrow x = \frac{c_1}{a_1} - \frac{b_1}{a_1}y$$

so

$$a_2\left(\frac{c_1}{a_1}-\frac{b_1}{a_1}y\right)+b_2y=c_2$$

This is linear in y.

Intersection of two Lines

Suppose ℓ_1, ℓ_2 are the lines

$$\ell_1 a_1 x + b_1 y = c_1$$

$$\ell_2 a_2 x + b_2 y = c_2$$

At least one of a_1, b_1 are $\neq 0$, say $a_1 \neq 0$. Then

$$a_1x + b_1y = c_1 \Leftrightarrow x = \frac{c_1}{a_1} - \frac{b_1}{a_1}y$$

SO

$$a_2\left(\frac{c_1}{a_1}-\frac{b_1}{a_1}y\right)+b_2y=c_2$$

This is linear in y.

Thus, x and y are obtained from $a_1, b_1, c_1, a_2, b_2, c_2$ using the operations of addition, subtraction, multiplication, and division.

Intersection of a Circle and Line

Suppose C is the circle

$$C: (x-h)^2 + (y-k)^2 = r^2$$

Intersection of a Circle and Line

Suppose C is the circle

$$C: (x-h)^2 + (y-k)^2 = r^2$$

and ℓ is the line

$$\ell: ax + by = c$$

where h, k, r, a, b, c are numbers which have already been constructed.

Intersection of a Circle and Line

Suppose C is the circle

$$C: (x-h)^2 + (y-k)^2 = r^2$$

and ℓ is the line

$$\ell: \quad ax + by = c$$

where h, k, r, a, b, c are numbers which have already been constructed. Then either $a \neq 0$ or $b \neq 0$. Say $a \neq 0$, so

$$ax + by = c \Leftrightarrow x = \frac{c}{a} - \frac{b}{a}y$$

Intersection of a Circle and Line

Suppose C is the circle

$$C: (x-h)^2 + (y-k)^2 = r^2$$

and ℓ is the line

$$\ell: ax + by = c$$

where h, k, r, a, b, c are numbers which have already been constructed. Then either $a \neq 0$ or $b \neq 0$. Say $a \neq 0$, so

$$ax + by = c \Leftrightarrow x = \frac{c}{a} - \frac{b}{a}y$$

Substituting into the equation for C gives a quadratic equation in y.

Intersection of a Circle and Line

Suppose C is the circle

$$C: (x-h)^2 + (y-k)^2 = r^2$$

and ℓ is the line

$$\ell: ax + by = c$$

where h, k, r, a, b, c are numbers which have already been constructed. Then either $a \neq 0$ or $b \neq 0$. Say $a \neq 0$, so

$$ax + by = c \Leftrightarrow x = \frac{c}{a} - \frac{b}{a}y$$

Substituting into the equation for C gives a quadratic equation in y. Thus, x and y are obtainable from h, k, r, a, b, c using the operations of addition, subtraction, multiplication, division, and taking square roots.

Intersection of Circles

Suppose C_1, C_2 are circles

$$C_1 : (x - h_1)^2 + (y - k_1)^2 = r_1^2$$

$$C_2 : (x - h_2)^2 + (y - k_2)^2 = r_2^2$$

where $h_1, k_1, h_2, k_2, r_1, r_2$ are numbers which have already been constructed.

Intersection of Circles

Suppose C_1, C_2 are circles

$$C_1 : (x - h_1)^2 + (y - k_1)^2 = r_1^2$$

$$C_2 : (x - h_2)^2 + (y - k_2)^2 = r_2^2$$

where $h_1, k_1, h_2, k_2, r_1, r_2$ are numbers which have already been constructed.

Then

$$(x - h_1)^2 + (y - k_1)^2 - r_1^2 = (x - h_2)^2 + (y - k_2)^2 - r_2^2$$

$$x^2 - 2h_1x + h_1^2 + y^2 - 2k_1y + k_1^2 - r_1^2 = x^2 - 2h_2x + h_2^2 + y^2 - 2k_2y + k_2^2 - r_2^2$$

$$2(h_2 - h_1)x + (h_1^2 + k_1^2 - r_1^2) = 2(k_1 - k_2)y + (h_2^2 + k_2^2 - r_2^2)$$

$$ax + by = c$$

where $a = 2(h_2 - h_1)$, $b = 2(k_2 - k_1)$, and $c = h_1^2 - h_2^2 + k_1^2 - k_2^2 + r_2^2 - r_1^2$. This reduces to the case of a circle and a line.
How Constructed Points Arise

Intersection of Circles

Suppose C_1, C_2 are circles

$$C_1 : (x - h_1)^2 + (y - k_1)^2 = r_1^2$$

$$C_2 : (x - h_2)^2 + (y - k_2)^2 = r_2^2$$

where $h_1, k_1, h_2, k_2, r_1, r_2$ are numbers which have already been constructed.

Then

$$(x - h_1)^2 + (y - k_1)^2 - r_1^2 = (x - h_2)^2 + (y - k_2)^2 - r_2^2$$

$$x^2 - 2h_1x + h_1^2 + y^2 - 2k_1y + k_1^2 - r_1^2 = x^2 - 2h_2x + h_2^2 + y^2 - 2k_2y + k_2^2 - r_2^2$$

$$2(h_2 - h_1)x + (h_1^2 + k_1^2 - r_1^2) = 2(k_1 - k_2)y + (h_2^2 + k_2^2 - r_2^2)$$

$$ax + by = c$$

where $a = 2(h_2 - h_1)$, $b = 2(k_2 - k_1)$, and $c = h_1^2 - h_2^2 + k_1^2 - k_2^2 + r_2^2 - r_1^2$.

How Constructed Points Arise

Intersection of Circles

Suppose C_1, C_2 are circles

$$C_1 : (x - h_1)^2 + (y - k_1)^2 = r_1^2$$

$$C_2 : (x - h_2)^2 + (y - k_2)^2 = r_2^2$$

where $h_1, k_1, h_2, k_2, r_1, r_2$ are numbers which have already been constructed.

Then

$$(x - h_1)^2 + (y - k_1)^2 - r_1^2 = (x - h_2)^2 + (y - k_2)^2 - r_2^2$$

$$x^2 - 2h_1x + h_1^2 + y^2 - 2k_1y + k_1^2 - r_1^2 = x^2 - 2h_2x + h_2^2 + y^2 - 2k_2y + k_2^2 - r_2^2$$

$$2(h_2 - h_1)x + (h_1^2 + k_1^2 - r_1^2) = 2(k_1 - k_2)y + (h_2^2 + k_2^2 - r_2^2)$$

$$ax + by = c$$

where $a = 2(h_2 - h_1)$, $b = 2(k_2 - k_1)$, and $c = h_1^2 - h_2^2 + k_1^2 - k_2^2 + r_2^2 - r_1^2$. This reduces to the case of a circle and a line.

Proposition

Suppose r is a root of the irreducible polynomial

$$a_n x^n + a_{n-1} x^{n-1} + \dots + a_2 x^2 + a_1 x + a_0$$

where each a_k is a root of an irreducible polynomial p_k with rational coefficients. Then r is the root of an irreducible polynomial with rational coefficients.

Proposition

Suppose r is a root of the irreducible polynomial

$$a_n x^n + a_{n-1} x^{n-1} + \dots + a_2 x^2 + a_1 x + a_0$$

where each a_k is a root of an irreducible polynomial p_k with rational coefficients. Then r is the root of an irreducible polynomial with rational coefficients.

Moreover, the degree of that irreducible polynomial divides $n \cdot \deg(p_0) \cdots \deg(p_n)$.

Application to Constructibility

Corollary

Suppose r is constructible. Then r is the root of an irreducible polynomial with rational coefficients of degree 2^n for some n.

Suppose r is constructible. Then r is the root of an irreducible polynomial with rational coefficients of degree 2^n for some n.

Proof.

Induction on the number k of square roots used to construct r.

Suppose r is constructible. Then r is the root of an irreducible polynomial with rational coefficients of degree 2^n for some n.

Proof.

Induction on the number k of square roots used to construct r. If k = 0, r is rational. Hence root of linear equation (degree $1 = 2^0$).

Suppose r is constructible. Then r is the root of an irreducible polynomial with rational coefficients of degree 2^n for some n.

Proof.

Induction on the number k of square roots used to construct r. If k = 0, r is rational. Hence root of linear equation (degree $1 = 2^0$). Induction hypothesis: assume true for constructible numbers using k square roots.

Suppose r is constructible. Then r is the root of an irreducible polynomial with rational coefficients of degree 2^n for some n.

Proof.

Induction on the number k of square roots used to construct r. If k = 0, r is rational. Hence root of linear equation (degree $1 = 2^0$). Induction hypothesis: assume true for constructible numbers using k square roots.

Suppose r uses k + 1 square roots, so $r = a + b\sqrt{c}$ where a, b, c use at most k square roots. Then r is a root of the quadratic

$$(x-a)^2-b^2c$$

Suppose r is constructible. Then r is the root of an irreducible polynomial with rational coefficients of degree 2^n for some n.

Proof.

Induction on the number k of square roots used to construct r. If k = 0, r is rational. Hence root of linear equation (degree $1 = 2^0$). Induction hypothesis: assume true for constructible numbers using k square roots.

Suppose r uses k + 1 square roots, so $r = a + b\sqrt{c}$ where a, b, c use at most k square roots. Then r is a root of the quadratic

$$(x-a)^2-b^2c$$

Proposition implies r is root of an irreducible polynomial with rational coefficients with degree dividing

$$2\cdot 2^k \cdot 2^k \cdot 2^k = 2^{3k+1}$$

Using ruler-and-compass constructions, it is not possible to square the circle, i.e. create a square with the same area as a unit circle.

Using ruler-and-compass constructions, it is not possible to square the circle, i.e. create a square with the same area as a unit circle.

Proof.

Squaring the circle is possible if and only if $\sqrt{\pi}$ is constructible.

Using ruler-and-compass constructions, it is not possible to square the circle, i.e. create a square with the same area as a unit circle.

Proof.

Squaring the circle is possible if and only if $\sqrt{\pi}$ is constructible.

But if $\sqrt{\pi}$ is constructible, it is the root of a polynomial.

Using ruler-and-compass constructions, it is not possible to square the circle, i.e. create a square with the same area as a unit circle.

Proof.

Squaring the circle is possible if and only if $\sqrt{\pi}$ is constructible.

But if $\sqrt{\pi}$ is constructible, it is the root of a polynomial.

 π is *transcendental*, not the root of any polynomial, so neither is $\sqrt{\pi}$.

Using ruler-and-compass constructions, it is not possible to construct a main diagonal of a unit cube.

Using ruler-and-compass constructions, it is not possible to construct a main diagonal of a unit cube.

Proof.

Doubling the cube is possible if and only if $\sqrt[3]{2}$ is constructible.

Using ruler-and-compass constructions, it is not possible to construct a main diagonal of a unit cube.

Proof.

Doubling the cube is possible if and only if $\sqrt[3]{2}$ is constructible.

If $\sqrt[3]{2}$ is constructible, it is the root of a polynomial p(x) with rational coefficients of degree 2^n for some *n*.

Using ruler-and-compass constructions, it is not possible to construct a main diagonal of a unit cube.

Proof.

Doubling the cube is possible if and only if $\sqrt[3]{2}$ is constructible.

If $\sqrt[3]{2}$ is constructible, it is the root of a polynomial p(x) with rational coefficients of degree 2^n for some *n*.

But $\sqrt[3]{2}$ is also the root of the irreducible polynomial $x^3 - 2$, so $x^3 - 2$ must divide p(x). This is impossible since 3 does not divide 2^n .

Impossibility of Trisecting Arbitrary Angles

Corollary

Using ruler-and-compass constructions, it is not always possible to trisect an arbitrary constructible angle.

Impossibility of Trisecting Arbitrary Angles

Corollary

Using ruler-and-compass constructions, it is not always possible to trisect an arbitrary constructible angle.

Proof.

If trisecting arbitrary angles is possible, then a 20° angle in primary position can be constructed since a 60° angle in primary position can be constructed. This angle intersects the unit circle at $\left(\cos\frac{\pi}{9},\sin\frac{\pi}{9}\right)$. Suffices to show $\cos\frac{\pi}{9}$ is not constructible.



Impossibility of Trisecting Arbitrary Angles

Corollary

Using ruler-and-compass constructions, it is not always possible to trisect an arbitrary constructible angle.

Proof.

If trisecting arbitrary angles is possible, then a 20° angle in primary position can be constructed since a 60° angle in primary position can be constructed. This angle intersects the unit circle at $\left(\cos\frac{\pi}{9},\sin\frac{\pi}{9}\right)$. Suffices to show $\cos\frac{\pi}{9}$ is not constructible.



The triple angle formula $\cos 3\theta = 4\cos^3 \theta - 3\cos \theta$ implies that $\cos \frac{\pi}{9}$ is a root of the cubic $4x^3 - 3x - \frac{1}{2}$. But 3 does not divide 2^n for any *n*, so $\cos \frac{\pi}{9}$ cannot be constructible.